

# GUIDELINES FOR REVIEWING A CORE READING PROGRAM RUBRIC AWARD Kindergarten

## *Directions for use:*

- Thoroughly review the core reading program using the corresponding rubric.
- Only evaluate the individual components that correlate with the grade level to review. *(Note the placement of the “x” within the grade level columns.)*
- Each indicator must receive a score using the following criteria:
  - 2 – Exceeds expectations
  - 1 – Meets expectations
  - 0 – Does not meet expectations*(For any indicator receiving a 0, comments must be provided justifying the score.)*
- Record the total score for each area in the final row for the section.



The Reviewing a Reading Program Professional Development Participant’s Guide publication was created for the Center on Instruction by the Florida Center for Reading Research at Florida State University. The Center on Instruction is operated by RMC Research Corporation in partnership with the Florida Center for Reading Research at Florida State University; Instructional Research Group; Lawrence Hall of Science at the University of California – Berkeley; Texas Institute for Measurement, Evaluation, and Statistics at the University of Houston; and The Meadows Center for Preventing Educational Risk at the University of Texas at Austin.

Guideline forms excerpted from *Reviewing a Reading Program Professional Development Module, Participant’s Guide*, 2008, Center on Instruction.

The contents of the module and this document were developed under cooperative agreement S283B050034 with the U.S. Department of Education. However, these contents do not necessarily represent the policy of the Department of Education, and you should not assume endorsement by the Federal Government.

INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN (ID)								Score	Comments <i>(examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
	K	1	2	3	4	5	6		

1. Is there empirical research on this program's efficacy?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
2. Are resources available to help the teacher understand the rationale for the instructional approach and program strategies (e.g., articles, explanations in the teacher manuals, references, and reliable websites)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
3. Does the comprehensive program address the five components of reading (phonological/phonemic awareness, phonics, fluency, vocabulary and comprehension)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
4. In addition to the five components of reading, are other dimensions of reading such as spelling, writing, oral language, and listening comprehension addressed?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
5. Is there a scope and sequence?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
6. Are goals and objectives clearly stated?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
7. Are student materials aligned with instructional objective of the lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
8. Do instructional materials increase in difficulty as students' skills strengthen?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The books start with a harder story-multiple lines and longer word.
9. Are all lessons and activities (e.g., whole group, small group, and centers) reading-related?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
10. Is there a clear and logical organization to the lessons in:									
the order and procedures of each day's lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
the inclusion of all necessary materials?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
the consistency of each day's lesson format?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
addressing the components of reading every day?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
11. Is instruction consistently explicit? Is it concise, specific, and related to the objective?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
12. Are teacher directives highly details to ensure accurate implementation?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
13. Does the lesson format facilitate frequent interactions between teacher and students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	Many of the lessons are formatted together.
14. Is instruction consistently systematic? Is there a prescribed order for introducing specific skills within each component of reading?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
15. Are there coordinated instructional sequences and instructional routines which include:									
Modeling?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	This is not very strong point.

Guided practice with feedback?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Student practice and application?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Cumulative review?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
16. Are there many guided practice opportunities for explicit teaching and teacher-directed feedback (for typically progressing readers and more for struggling readers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Small groups don't meet with teacher daily.
17. Does the program provide clear guidance for the teacher to document student progress and inform instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
18. Does instruction make a clear connection <i>among</i> all five components?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
19. Is scaffolding a prominent part of the lessons?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Scaffolding is not very prominent.
20. Are instructions for scaffolding specific within each lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	No evidence.
21. Are teachers encouraged to give immediate, specific feedback (corrective or positive)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
22. Is differentiated instruction prominent?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Differentiated instruction not found.
23. Is instruction differentiated based on assessment?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Differentiated instruction not found.
24. Are directions for differentiating instruction specific?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Evidence not found in teacher's guide.
25. Is small-group instruction (small teacher-pupil ratio) part of daily instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Every group doesn't receive small group instruction daily.
26. Are there guidelines for forming flexible groups based on student progress?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Guidelines for forming flexible groups not found.
27. Are enrichment activities included for advanced students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Enrichment activities not found.
28. Does the program provide instruction for English Learners?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
29. Does the program specify for whom it is appropriate (e.g., students on or above grade level, students slightly behind their peers, students more than one grade level behind their peers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Seems to be whole class or just small groups. Doesn't say who it would be appropriate for. Most of the lessons are to be completed together or in small groups
30. Does the program specify who should provide instruction for accurate implementation (e.g., special education teacher, general education teacher, paraprofessional, or volunteer)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Program does not specify who should provide instruction.
31. Does the program specify the instructional setting (e.g., general education classroom, computer lab, or resource room)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>30</b>	

<b>PHONOLOGICAL/ PHONEMIC AWARENESS (PA)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> <i>(examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is phonological/phonemic awareness instruction <b>explicit</b> ?	X	X						1	
2. Is phonological/phonemic awareness instruction <b>systematic</b> ?	X	X						1	
3. Does phonological/phonemic awareness instruction include <b>coordinated instructional sequences</b> and <b>routines</b> ?	X	X						1	
4. Is phonological/phonemic awareness instruction <b>scaffolded</b> ?	X	X						1	
5. Does phonological/phonemic awareness instruction include <b>cumulative review</b> ?	X	X						1	
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in phonological/phonemic awareness?	X	X						1	
7. Is PA only a small portion of the daily lesson?	X	X						1	
8. Does each day's lesson focus on only one or two PA skills (as opposed to several)?	X	X						1	
9. Are there instructions for PA activities to alert the teacher to student readiness?	X	X						1	
10. Does the program contain instructional activities that are designed to stimulate the growth of phonemic awareness?	X	X						1	
11. Does PA start with larger units (words and syllables) and progress to smaller units (phonemes)?	X	X						1	
12. Does PA start with rhyming and progress to phoneme isolation, blending, segmenting, and phoneme manipulation?	X	X						0	No progression evident.
13. Do students count the number of words in spoken sentences?	X							1	
14. Are there rhyming activities (recognition and production)?	X							1	
15. Are there alliteration activities?	X							0	Alliteration activities not evident.
16. Are there activities that involve counting the number of syllables in a word?	X							1	
17. Are there activities that involve blending and segmenting syllables in a word?	X							1	
18. Are there activities for students to blend onsets and rimes?	X							1	

PHONEMIC AWARENESS									
19. Do activities follow the continuum of word types (beginning with short words that contain two or three phonemes)?	X	X						1	
20. Does instruction include physical representations (e.g., clapping, Elkonin boxes with markers, counters, tiles, fingers, and auditory cues) to help students make the connection between sounds and print (the alphabetic principle)?	X	X						1	
21. When PA activities are at the phoneme level, do students' activities target the first sound in words and then move to the last sound in words and finally focus on the middle sound in words?	X	X						2	
22. Are there blending activities at the phoneme level?	X	X						1	
23. Are there segmenting activities at the phoneme level?	X	X						1	
24. Once students demonstrate early phonemic awareness, is PA instruction linked to phonics instruction?	X	X						1	
25. Does the program specify when oral language PA activities should be phased out?	X	X						0	Program does not specify when PA activities should be phased out.
26. Are the words used in PA activities found in subsequent word lists and text readings?1	X	X						1	
27. Does the program include a pronunciation guide for the various features of sound production (e.g., stop sounds and continuous sounds)?	X	X						1	
28. Do computer-based programs pronounce sounds distinctly, correctly, and without distortion?	X	X						1	
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>26</b>	

FLUENCY (F)	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	Score	Comments (examples, strengths, concerns, questions)
1. Is fluency instruction <b>explicit</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
2. Is fluency instruction <b>systematic</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
3. Does fluency instruction include <b>coordinated instructional sequences</b> and <b>routines</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
4. Is fluency instruction <b>scaffolded</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	

5. Does fluency instruction include <b>cumulative review</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in fluency?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Assessments are online. Fluency measure is not evident
7. Does the program address all dimensions of fluency (speed, accuracy, and prosody)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	In guided reading lessons some work with voice (prosody) but not enough to meet expectations. Fluency needs to be addressed daily.
8. Does the program encourage the teacher to model speed, accuracy, and prosody?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
9. Are letter-sounds taught and practiced frequently to promote automaticity?	X	X						1	
10. Does fluency practice during letter-sound study and text reading involve the teacher's providing feedback to students?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
11. Is fluency instruction integrated into each day's lesson?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Fluency is only addressed 2-3 times per week. Needs to be addressed daily.
12. Is the decoding strategy taught so that it becomes automatic?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Decoding is not taught enough so that it becomes automatic.
13. Are irregular words taught to be recognized automatically?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
14. Is an explicit strategy taught as students transition from reading words in lists to reading connected text?	X	X						1	
15. After error correction, are students asked to reread the word, word list, or sentence correctly and then to reread it from the beginning?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Because of online reading there is no way to know if this is going on or even if the kids are reading at all. They only have to click next.
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>10</b>	

<b>VOCABULARY (V)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>		<b>Comments</b> (e.g., examples, strengths, concerns, questions)
1. Is vocabulary instruction <b>explicit</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
2. Is vocabulary instruction <b>systematic</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
3. Does vocabulary instruction include <b>coordinated instructional sequences</b> and <b>routines</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
4. Is vocabulary instruction <b>scaffolded</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
5. Does vocabulary instruction include <b>cumulative review</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Some review with content vocabulary but no review of all

									vocabulary taught.
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in <b>vocabulary</b> ?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Assessments are not included for measuring or monitoring progress in vocabulary.
7. Is emphasis placed on listening and speaking vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
8. Is there emphasis on reading and writing vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
9. Are students exposed to diverse vocabulary through listening to or reading narrative and expository texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
10. Does the program include frequent use of teacher read-alouds using higher level books with explanation and instruction of key vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
11. Does vocabulary instruction occur before, during, and after reading?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
12. Are a limited number of words selected for robust, explicit vocabulary instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
13. Are important, useful, and difficult words taught?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
14. Does the instructional routine for vocabulary include:									
Introducing the word?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Presenting a student-friendly explanation?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Clarifying the word with examples?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Checking students' understanding?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
15. Are ample opportunities provided to engage in oral vocabulary activities that:									
Repeat exposure to words in rich and multiple contexts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Use everyday language to explain word meanings?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Connect word meanings to prior knowledge?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Evident of prior knowledge connections.
16. Are students given multiple opportunities to use new words in reading sentences, paragraphs, or longer texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
17. Is extended instruction provided in multiple contexts to promote word awareness using word banks, vocabulary logs, writing, semantic maps, concept definition mapping, and word classification?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
18. Are strategies taught over time to ensure understanding and correct application?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	

19. Are various aspects of word study included (either under vocabulary or word recognition) such as:									
Concepts of word meaning?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Vocabulary instruction does not include concepts of word meaning.
Multiple meanings?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Vocabulary instruction does not include multiple meanings.
Synonyms?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Vocabulary instruction does not include synonyms.
Antonyms?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Vocabulary instruction does not include antonyms.
20. Is the use of context to gain the meaning of an unfamiliar word kept to a minimum?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
21. Is computer technology used to help teach vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	The entire program is very visual with pictures to help with many aspects of vocabulary.
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>23</b>	

<b>COMPRHENSION (C)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> (examples, strengths, concerns, questions)
1. Is comprehension instruction explicit?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
2. Is comprehension instruction systematic?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
3. Does comprehension instruction include coordinated instructional sequences and routines?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
4. Is comprehension instruction scaffolded?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
5. Does comprehension instruction include cumulative review?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
6. Are assessments included to measure and monitor progress in comprehension?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
7. Is learning to determine which strategy to use and why (metacognition) part of instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Metacognition is not part of comprehension instruction.
8. When a strategy is taught, is it applied frequently so students understand its usefulness?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	

9. Does program instruction enable students to establish and adjust purposes for reading (e.g., reading to understand, interpret, inform, to enjoy, and to solve problems)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
10. Does instruction support the use of multiple, coordinated comprehension strategies?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
11. Are guided and supported cooperative learning groups suggested as an instructional technique?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
12. Does instruction begin with the use of short passages?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Not evident.
13. Does instruction emphasize that students have a conceptual understanding of beginning, middle, and end?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Beginning, middle, and end are not taught specifically as a comprehension skill.
14. Does the program provide prompts for the teacher to guide the students through texts using think-alouds?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
15. Are models of effective questioning techniques (e.g., Bloom's taxonomy) provided to guide and monitor students' comprehension?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
16. Are there ample opportunities for students to listen to narrative and expository text?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
17. Is instruction in narrative and expository text structures explicit?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	2	
18. Do texts contain useful and familiar concepts and vocabulary?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
19. Are there instructional routines for comprehension strategies for use before, during, and after reading (e.g., prediction, story grammar, summarization, graphic organizers)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
20. Is the "main idea" strategy taught systematically (e.g., using pictures, then individual sentences, then paragraphs, etc.)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
21. Are elements of story grammar (e.g., setting, characters, important events, etc.) taught and used for retelling a story?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
22. Does instruction focus on discussion story grammar and comparing stories?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
23. Is story grammar introduced systematically, beginning with simple text that gradually becomes more complex?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	The stories start hard then get easier. Characters have hard names with odd vowel sounds at the beginning.
24. Are students taught to use graphic organizers to illustrate relationships among concepts in text (e.g., story maps, Venn diagrams, and semantic maps)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	Use of diagrams, graphs and charts found. There is a need to see more for guiding comprehension.

25. Are explicit strategies for interpreting information from charts, graphs, tables, and diagrams taught?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
26. After instruction, is there systematic review of:									
Literal comprehension?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Retelling?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Main idea?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
Summarization?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>27</b>	

<b>STANDARDS ALIGNMENT</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> (examples, strengths, concerns, questions)
1. Is clear alignment provided to the Common Core State Standards?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Not all standards are covered. Many are missing. Strands evident but indicators are missing.
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>0</b>	

<b>MOTIVATION AND ENGAGEMENT (M&amp;E)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> (examples, strengths, concerns, questions)
1. Does the program direct the teacher in ways to increase student motivation such as:									
2. Making reading relevant to students' lives?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
3. Providing meaningful goals for learning from texts?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
4. Making available a variety of choices (e.g., texts and assignments) that align with instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
5. Providing opportunities for students to work collaboratively?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Kids spend too much time working independently on the computer. Kids need to interact with each other and teacher to drive their thinking deeper (rigor).
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>3</b>	

<b>ASSESSMENT (A)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> <i>(examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Are assessments included that teachers can use to guide student movement through the program (e.g., screening, progress monitoring, diagnostic, and outcome measures)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	The assessments are online. It would be very difficult to run an error analysis to determine where the kids are having specific difficulties.
2. Does the program provide teacher guidance in using assessment results to differentiate instruction?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Program does not provide teacher with guidance in using assessment results to differentiate instruction.
3. Do the assessments identify students who are at risk or already experiencing difficulty learning to read?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	0	Assessments do not identify students who are at risk or already having difficulty learning to read.
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>0</b>	

<b>PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (PD)</b>	<b>K</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comments</b> <i>(examples, strengths, concerns, questions)</i>
1. Is adequate time offered for teachers to learn new concepts and practice what they have learned?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
2. Is there a plan for coaches, mentors, peers, or outside experts to provide feedback to teachers and follow-up assistance as they put new concepts into practice?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
3. Are teachers taught how to administer and interpret assessments that accompany the program?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
4. Is program PD customized to meet participants' varying needs (e.g., first-year teachers, coaches, and principals)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
5. Does the PD provide support (e.g., principal checklists, follow-up, in-class modeling, and a CD for viewing model lessons to facilitate application of content)?	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	1	
<b>TOTAL</b>								<b>5</b>	